

RETHINKING THE FUNDAMENTALS OF ETHNIC FEDERALISM IN ETHIOPIA

Dissertation

zur Erlangung des Doktorgrades

der Juristischen Fakultät

der Georg-August-Universität zu Göttingen

vorgelegt von

Semahagn Gashu Abebe

aus Addis Abeba, Äthiopien.

Göttingen 2015

Table of Contents

Table of Statutes	1
Acknowledgements	2
List of Acronyms	4
Introduction	5
Chapter 1: Federalism and the Accommodation of Diversity	13
A. Definition and Theories of Federalism	13
B. Basic Features of Federations	16
I. Federalism as a Constitutionally Agreed Contract.....	16
II. Distribution of Powers in Federations.....	17
III. Democracy and Federations	17
C. Types of Federations	20
I. Holding-Together versus Coming-Together Federations	20
II. Symmetrical versus Asymmetrical Federations	21
III. Co-operative versus Competitive Federations	21
D. Advantages and Pitfalls of Federations	22
I. Advantages of Federal Systems	22
II. The Pitfalls in Building a Federal System	24
III. Conditions for Forging a Successful Federation.....	25
E. Conceptual Framework on Ethnicity and Group Rights	26
I. Ethnicity and Ethnic Groups	27
II. Approaches to Understanding Ethnicity.....	27
III. Nations and Nationalism	29
IV. Minority Groups	30
F. Ethnic Conflicts and Modes of Accommodating Ethnic Diversity	32
I. Federalism as a Response to Challenges of Accommodating Linguistic Diversity.....	37
II. Consociationalism as a Mode of Political Bargaining in Divided Societies	40
III. The Right to Self-Determination and Secession as a Response to Ethno-Regional Demands.....	42
1. The Scope of the Right to Self-Determination under International Law	42
2. The Right to Secession and Federations	47
G. Justifications for Adopting a Multicultural Federal System	51
H. Challenges of a Multicultural Federal System	53
I. Factors Essential for Forging a Successful Multicultural Federal System	55
J. Multicultural Federalism and Democracy	57
K. Summary	61
Chapter 2: Socialist Federations and the Accommodation of Diversity	62
A. The Origin and Development of Socialist Federations	62
I. Union of Soviet Socialist Republic (USSR)	62
II. Czechoslovakia	67
III. Yugoslavia.....	68
B. Fundamental Features of Socialist Federations	69
I. The Doctrine of the Right to Self-determination of Nationalities up to Secession	70
II. Indigenisation and Empowering of Local Elites	74
III. Separation of Powers and Rule of Law in Socialist Federations	77
IV. Patron-Client Party Structure and the Principle of Democratic Centralism.....	83
C. Summary	87
Chapter 3: Introduction to Ethiopian Constitution and History	88

A. Ethnic and Religious Diversity and Political Changes in Ethiopia	89
B. 1991- A New Dispensation in Restructuring the Ethiopian State	92
C. The Origin and Design of the Ethiopian Federal System	95
D. Basic Features of the Federal Democratic Republic of Ethiopia (FDRE) Constitution and State Structure	102
E. Constitutional Development in Ethiopia until 1991	106
F. A Brief History of Ethiopia until 1991.....	108
G. Summary	115
Chapter 4: Development of Ideological Radicalism and Ethno-regional Movements in Ethiopia	116
A. Lack of Social Transformation and Emergence of Ideological Radicalism in Ethiopia	116
B. Development of Ethno-Nationalist Movements in Ethiopia.....	125
C. Major Ethno-Regional Movements in Ethiopia	130
I. Eritrean Separatist Movement.....	130
II. Tigrayan Nationalist Movement	133
Chapter 5: The Fundamental Ideological Principles Governing Ethnic Federalism in Ethiopia	136
A. Salient Features of Socialist Federation relevant to Ethiopia’s Ethnic Federal System	136
B. History of Ethiopian People’s Revolutionary Democratic Front (EPRDF)	139
C. Background of Development of TPLF/EPRDF’s Ideological Conceptions	141
D. The Fundamental Ideological Principles of TPLF/EPRDF and their Implications... 146	
I. The Doctrine of the Right to Self-determination of Nationalities	147
II. The Merits of Revolutionary Democracy and its Implications.....	149
III. The Developmental State Model and its Implications	157
IV. The Principle of Democratic Centralism and Its Implications.....	164
E. <i>Gingemma</i> (Party evaluation) System and its Impacts	169
F. The Impacts of Neo-Patrimonial Party Networks and Rent-Seeking Trends	171
G. Summary	173
Chapter 6: The Principle of the Right to Self-determination in the Ethiopian Ethnic Federal System and its Implications.....	174
A. General Background	175
B. Addressing Ethno-regional Demands under the FDRE Constitution	177
C. Factors behind the Adoption of an Ethnic Federal System in Ethiopia.....	179
I. A Response to Ethno-regional Demands	179
II. The Impact of Marxist-Leninist Ideology and Stalinist Dogma of Question of Nationalities	183
III. Instrumentalising of Ethno-Regional Demands	185
D. Critics on the Adoption of Ethnic Federal System in Ethiopia.....	189
E. Pitfalls in the Application of the Right to Self-determination and Secession	195
F. The Implications of Ethnic Political Discourse on Common Citizenship, Individual Rights and Multiple Identities.....	201
G. The Need for Consensus on Modes of Accommodating Ethno-regional Demands in Ethiopia.....	208
H. Summary	217
Chapter 7: The Implications of Party Ideology in the Structure and Function of Ethiopia’s Ethnic Federal System	218
A. Vertical Separation of Power under the Ethiopian Federal System	219
I. Competencies of the Federal Government.....	220
II. Competencies of Regional Governments	221

III. Intergovernmental Relations and the Role of Party Ideology.....	223
IV. The Loopholes in <i>De jure</i> Intergovernmental Relations in Ethiopia's Federal System	224
V. The Party Ideology and <i>De facto</i> Intergovernmental Relations	231
B. Horizontal Structure of the Ethiopian Federal System and the Role of Party Ideology	
.....	237
I. The House of Peoples' Representatives and the Impact of Party Ideology	239
II. The Role of Party Ideology in the Structure and Function of the House of Federation	243
III. The Role of Party Ideology in Shaping a Dominant Executive Organ	246
IV. The Role of Party Ideology in Weakening the Judicial System in Ethiopia.....	257
V. The Role of Party Ideology in the Adjudication of Constitutional Issues.....	265
VI. Non-amendable Constitution?	272
C. Summary.....	276
Chapter 8: The Role of Party Ideology in the Democratisation and Protection of	
Human Rights in Ethiopia	277
A. Challenges of Transition to Democracy and Protection of Human Rights in Ethiopia	
.....	278
B. The Role of Party Ideology in Weakening Democratic Institutions in Ethiopia.....	284
C. The Impact of Party Ideology on Multi-party Democracy in Ethiopia	287
D. The Impact of Party Ideology on Development of Civil Society Organisations (CSOs)	
.....	291
E. The Impact of the Party Ideology on the Independent Media in Ethiopia.....	294
F. Summary.....	298
Concluding Remarks	299
Bibliography	306
Lebenslauf	334
Deutsche Zusammenfassung: Der ethnische Föderalismus in Äthiopien – eine	
kritische Bestandsaufnahme seiner Grundlagen.....	335